



World Vision Zimbabwe

World Vision Zimbabwe Cyclone Idai Response Program: Management Response to the Recommendations of the Report of the Evaluation of the DEC Funded Projects

Introduction:

Cyclone IDAI struck Zimbabwe and Mozambique on the 15th of March 2019 leaving a trail of destruction and affecting over 270,000. World Vision Zimbabwe responded with support in the education, food security and nutrition, livelihoods, shelter, protection and water and sanitation sectors. With funding from Disaster Emergencies Committee (DEC), WVZ supported affected schools with infrastructure rehabilitation, water and sanitation facilities, learning materials and psychosocial support. WVZ commissioned an evaluation of the DEC funded education program and other complementary grants in education, food security and nutrition implemented in Chimanimani. Jimat Consultants, an independent evaluation consultancy firm, conducted the Evaluation between May and July 2020. The consultants came up with a number of recommendations following in-depth analysis of the findings.

WVZ takes note of the following recommendations made by Jimat Consultants following the end of project evaluation for DEC1 &2 Cyclone IDAI Response Projects. Having considered the proposed recommendations WVZ takes on board recommendations 1, 2,3.4 &5 (*combined*) and 9.

Recommendation 1: Consider the differential needs of girls and boys in provision of toilets.

Findings from the evaluation show that boys and girls were allocated equal number of toilets. The findings further show that World Vision Zimbabwe constructed 10 squat holes toilets at each of the supported schools. *Following this finding and recommendation World Vision will ensure that its future programs gender sensitive. Where toilet construction is involved SPHERE minimum standards and other national standards will be adhered to ensure the correct ratios for both boys and girls.*

Recommendation 2: Plan for inaccessibility issues in contingency planning

Accessing affected communities and institutions was a big challenge for WVZ. Inaccessibility delayed provision of support and transportation of building materials to Chimanimani district. *In making contingency plans, WVZ will consider how support can be delivered with limited accessibility including alternative ways of delivering assistance and support in hard-to-reach areas. This will be done in coordination with such forums such as the Civil Protection Unit (CPU). Working with the CPU World Vision Zimbabwe will seek to advocate for national or provincial contingency plans that clearly stipulate how evacuations and other forms of support will be rendered to affected communities.*

Recommendation 3: Adequately staff procurement function in emergencies

One of the major evaluation findings was that procurement processes delayed program implementation to a large extent. A major challenge with procurement was cited as inadequate staffing of the procurement role at district level. Additionally, respondents suggested that at national level, WVZ should have a procurement person specifically dedicated to the emergency program from the onset of the response. *In future emergencies, WVZ will ensure that all departments are adequately resourced from the outset. As part of emergency preparedness, the organization will have its long-term program and administrative staff trained key elements of emergency response procurement in emergency contexts.*

Recommendation 9: Include Value for Money metrics at program inception and in regular monitoring and evaluation.

The evaluation team mainly used qualitative and proxy measures to make conclusions on the program VfM. The program had no agreed inbuilt measures for VfM and therefore was not specifically tracking VfM. In future responses, especially after the initial acute emergency response phase, WVZ management, finance, Monitoring and evaluation teams should consider designing VfM measurements that can be used as the response is implemented. This would assist in real time course correction and adaptation of the response based on current information. Whilst ex-post VfM measures are important for future planning, real time measures assist current programming and make end of project VfM judgements easier and more systematic and quantitative.

World Vision takes note of this recommendation will endeavour to define value for money from an organizational perspective and develop an evaluation or assessment criteria to be used in evaluations or routine reviews.

Recommendations 4&5 have been considered and these are being implemented to a large scale and feedback and complaints mechanisms are available to include the toll-free number both voice and SMS. These will be strengthened through enhanced information provision and trainings to our teams.

Recommendation 4: Promote higher level feedback mechanisms.

The program had several complaints and feedback mechanisms. Most of the methods mentioned by key informants involved interacting directly with WVZ field staff. Whilst these channels worked well and are good for interaction between stakeholders, beneficiaries and staff, there is need for stakeholders and beneficiaries to be aware of mechanisms in which they can contact higher level WVZ staff if they can't get recourse from field staff. Whilst WVZ had whistle blower mechanisms in the field, WVZ field staff and coordinators should promote mechanisms such as toll-free numbers among stakeholders and communities.

Toll-free already available functionality will be strengthened through information provision and training of staff.

Recommendation 5: Promote child centered feedback and complaints mechanisms.

Whilst respondents in the survey and key informants extensively mentioned other feedback and complaints mechanisms, child centric methods didn't come up. The final beneficiaries of the education program were students in affected schools. Although the evaluation team

could not triangulate this finding with the children themselves due to the data collection environment during the COVID-19 pandemic, the WVZ accountability coordinator and child protection officers should institute a child specific feedback mechanism in emergencies.

A range feedback mechanisms established in consultation with communities already exist including child friendly participatory approaches. As noted already these will be strengthened through information provision and regular refresher trainings for staff.

Recommendations 6,7 & 8 have been considered. However, in the current climate/strategy/context these recommendations will not be implemented at the moment.

Recommendation 6: Train community level structures in basic project management.

One of the most important community structures when working with schools is the SDC. In the WVZ cyclone program, SDCs were responsible for prioritising school needs, liaising with WVZ field staff, mobilising the community to contribute local building materials, fundraising, managing builders and managing the building inventory among other things. In interviews, SDC members stated that they did not receive any formal training on these functions from the program. School Development Committee members learnt on the job and used their prior experience. In future emergency responses WVZ field coordinators should look at the possibility of providing some basic short training on topics like project management, bookkeeping, warehousing and fundraising to SDCs. This may improve SDCs performance and increase sustainability.

Recommendation 7: Guard against politicisation of aid.

The program worked extensively with local leadership and local structures. This approach is good for building back better and for sustainability. Some key informants were however worried about the possibility of local structures selecting benefiting households based on political affiliation, especially for components that involve handouts like the livelihood project and food aid. When selecting beneficiaries, WVZ field officer should be aware of this possibility and put in place mechanisms to prevent it. Field managers should institute verification procedures given the heightened risk of politicisation.

Recommendation 8: Fundraise for longer term programming in affected areas.

The cyclone affected the eastern more than the western part of Chimanimani district. Non-Governmental Organizations including WVZ usually implement programs in the western parts of the district. Headmasters noted that the cyclone hit already old and fragile school infrastructure. The cyclone affected farmers' horticultural and farming livelihood system. Given the devastating impacts of the cyclone, households and schools will require longer term support in re-establishing livelihoods and rebuilding. World Vision Zimbabwe country management should fundraise to support longer term development initiatives in the affected areas in the livelihoods and education sector.

Recommendation 7,8 and 10 are being implemented already and will continue to be monitored and evaluated.

Recommendation 7: Guard against politicisation of aid.

The program worked extensively with local leadership and local structures. This approach is good for building back better and for sustainability. Some key informants were however worried about the possibility of local structures selecting benefiting households based on political affiliation, especially for components that involve handouts like the livelihood project and food aid. When selecting beneficiaries, WVZ field officer should be aware of this possibility and put in place mechanisms to prevent it. Field managers should institute verification procedures given the heightened risk of politicisation.

Recommendation 8: Fundraise for longer term programming in affected areas.

The cyclone affected the eastern more than the western part of Chimanimani district. Non-Governmental Organizations including WVZ usually implement programs in the western parts of the district. Headmasters noted that the cyclone hit already old and fragile school infrastructure. The cyclone affected farmers' horticultural and farming livelihood system. Given the devastating impacts of the cyclone, households and schools will require longer term support in re-establishing livelihoods and rebuilding. World Vision Zimbabwe country management should fundraise to support longer term development initiatives in the affected areas in the livelihoods and education sector.

Recommendation 10: Sensitise communities on potential negative environmental impacts of sourcing raw materials.

Whilst the WVZ sourced raw materials from EMA approved sites the program had no control of how and where local communities got their inputs. These included bricks and quarry stones. If unchecked, this is a potential source of environmental degradation. In future responses, WVZ field staff need to sensitize local communities on environmentally friendly sourcing of local raw materials such as bricks.

Programs should be aware of how local materials are obtained, assess if there are potential negative environmental impacts and, working with local communities, put in place mitigation measures if need be.

Conclusion

On the whole WVZ acknowledges and concurs with the assertions made by Jimat Consultants on the CHS Commitments as well as the recommendations as indicated above. World Vision remain committed to providing life-saving humanitarian assistance and work with local communities to build resilience and capacity bounce back better in the event of shocks.